



22 February 2022

MS. BERNADETTE ROMULO-PUYAT

Secretary, Department of Tourism and TPB Chairperson

MS. MARIA ANTHONETTE C. VELASCO-ALLONES

Chief Operation Officer (COO)

TOURISM PROMOTIONS BOARD (TPB)

4/F Legaspi Towers, 300 Roxas Boulevard
Manila

**RE : VALIDATION RESULT OF 2020 PERFORMANCE
SCORECARD OF TPB**

Dear Secretary Romulo-Puyat and COO Velasco-Allones,

This is to formally transmit the validation result of TPB's 2020 Performance Scorecard. Based on the Governance Commission's validation of the GOCC's documentary submissions, TPB gained an over-all score of **23.41%** (See **Annex A**). The same is to be posted in TPB's website, in accordance with Section 43 of GCG Memorandum Circular (M.C.) No. 2012-07.¹

In relation to the grant of 2020 Performance-Based Bonus (PBB) to eligible officers and employees, TPB fails to satisfy the requirements of GCG M.C. No. 2019-02,² particularly the achievement of a weighted-average score of at least 90% in its 2020 Performance Scorecard. In this regard, the Board is reminded that any unilateral action to release the PBB will be considered as a violation of the Board's fiduciary duty to protect the assets of the GOCC as provided under Section 19 of Republic Act No. 10149.³

Consequently, pursuant to GCG M.C. No. 2021-01,⁴ failure to qualify for the PBB means that the Appointive Members of the Governing Board of TPB shall not be qualified to receive the Performance-Based Incentive (PBI).

FOR TPB'S INFORMATION AND GUIDANCE.

Very truly yours,

Digitally signed by:
CHAIRMAN SAMUEL G. DAGPIN, JR.

Digitally signed by:
COMMISSIONER MICHAEL P. CLORIBEL

Digitally signed by:
COMMISSIONER MARITES C. DORAL

cc: COA Resident Auditor – TPB

¹ CODE OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE, dated 28 November 2012.

² INTERIM PERFORMANCE-BASED BONUS (PBB), dated 25 July 2019.

³ AN ACT TO PROMOTE FINANCIAL VIABILITY AND FISCAL DISCIPLINE IN GOVERNMENT-OWNED OR -CONTROLLED CORPORATIONS AND TO STRENGTHEN THE ROLE OF THE STATE IN ITS GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT TO MAKE THEM MORE RESPONSIVE TO THE NEEDS OF PUBLIC INTEREST AND FOR OTHER PURPOSES, dated 06 June 2011.

⁴ INTERIM PERFORMANCE-BASED INCENTIVE (PBI) SYSTEM FOR THE APPOINTIVE DIRECTORS OF GOCCs COVERED BY GCG FOR FY 2020 AND FOR THE YEARS THEREAFTER, dated 28 January 2021.

TOURISM PROMOTIONS BOARD (TPB)
Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard

Component					TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating				
CUSTOMERS/STAKEHOLDERS	SO 1	Coordinated and Sustainable Tourism Promotions and Marketing Recovery Program										
	SM 1	Number of TPB-Initiated Domestic and International Projects held in the Philippines	Total Number of <u>Implemented</u> Domestic and International Projects held in the Philippines / Total Number of Planned Domestic and International Projects held in the Philippines	12.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	75% Implementation of the Total Planned Domestic and International Projects	20 Events Implemented / 19 Planned Events = 105.26%	12.5%	Cannot Be Validated	0%	List of TPB-Initiated Domestic and International Projects held in the Philippines Copies of Accomplishment Reports, TPB Bulletins, Presentation Materials, and Terminal Reports	From the supporting documents provided, the Governance Commission was unable to determine which of the events are considered as planned events. Considering that the intent of the measure is to ensure that the TPB carry out its planned events for the year and that there was insufficient documentation submitted by the corporation to establish that the domestic and international projects were planned, a zero rating was awarded.
	SM 2	Generate Return on Marketing Investment (ROMI) of TPB Domestic and International Marketing and Promotions Projects	(Benefit-Cost) / Cost ²	10%	Below 1179% = 0% 1179% to 1189% = 5% 1190% to 1200% = 8% Above 1200% = 10%	Above 1200%	Benefits Generated: ₱12,773,899,435.42 Budget Utilized: ₱76,281,758.09 ROMI: 16,645.68%	10%	Cannot Be Validated	0%	Copies of Terminal Reports, Accomplishment Reports, Mileage Reports, Market Profiles, Disbursement Vouchers, and Budget Utilization Requests Status	The Governance Commission could not objectively verify the reported accomplishment as there were no guidelines on the computation of the conversion rates. It was noted that some projects do not have a conversion rate while for projects with a conversion rate, the percentage rates from 5% to 44.48%. Moreover, the amounts in the provided disbursement vouchers do not tally with the reported actual budget utilization rate on domestic and international

¹ Based on the latest PES Accomplishment Report provided through TPB's submission dated 08 November 2021.

² Where: Benefit = values generated out of sales (e.g., tour packages sold, etc.; i.e. but does not include private sector participation fees paid to TPB); and Cost = project fund expended by TPB

Component						TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target		Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
											marketing and promotions projects.
SM 3	Generate Return on Marketing Investment (ROMI) of TPB Marketing Communications Projects	(Media Values – Media Spend) / Media Spend ³	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	Above 120%	Media/PR Values: ₱929,018,573.76 Budget Utilized: ₱397,456,547.00 ROMI: 133.74%	10%	Cannot Be Validated	0%	Copies of Mileage Reports, Disbursement Vouchers, and Budget Utilization Request Status	The Governance Commission did not consider projects with only the Budget Utilization Request Status submitted as such document do not reflect the obligated or disbursed amount on marketing communications projects of the corporation. The measure could not be validated using only the submitted disbursement vouchers as the equivalent media values amounts to be excluded could not be determined.
SO 2 Cultivate Partnership with Stakeholders and Customers											
SM 4	Number of TPB-Supported Events/Projects Organized by Foreign Suppliers	Supported Events/Projects Organized by Foreign Suppliers / Total Number of Expected Events/ Projects Organized by Foreign Suppliers with Request Support from TPB	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	Support 75% of the Total Expected Events/Projects Organized by Foreign Suppliers	39 Supported Events/ 21 Expected Events = 185.71%	10%	Cannot Be Validated	0%	Copies of Accomplishment Reports, Terminal Reports, and Project Brief Forms List of Expected and Actual Events Assisted	Similar with the case of SM 1, the Governance Commission could not establish that the events reported are expected events with the documentation submitted by the TPB.

³ Where: Media Values = impression, reach, etc.; Media Spend = cost paid for placements, etc.

Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component						TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target		Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
SM 5	Number of TPB-Assisted Domestic and International Promotions Projects Organized by Philippine Stakeholders	Assisted Domestic and International Promotions Projects Organized by Philippines Stakeholders / Total Number of Domestic and International Promotions Projects Organized by Philippines Stakeholders with Request for Assistance from TPB	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	Assist 75% of the Total Anticipated Domestic and International Promotions Projects Organized by Philippine Stakeholders	56 Assisted Events / 60 Anticipated Events = 93.33%	10%	Cannot Be Validated	0%	Copies of Accomplishment Reports, Terminal Reports, and Project Brief Forms List of Anticipated and Actual Events Assisted	The Governance Commission could not validate the measure due to the non-submission of the requested copies of the requests from Philippine stakeholders. The requested document would aid in the validation of the summary list provided by the TPB.
SO 3 Improve Customer Satisfaction Rating											
SM 6a	Percentage of Satisfied Customers (Exhibitors)	Number of Respondents who gave at least Satisfactory Rating / Total Number of Respondents	2.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight If Below 80% = 0%	90%	Exhibitors: 96.77% are Satisfied Attendees: 96.83% are Satisfied	2.5%	Cannot Be Validated	0%	Tabulation of the Aggregate Data (Exhibitors, Attendees, and Familiarization Trip Participants and Social Media Influencers) Full Report on TPB's 2020	In the Final Report prepared by the third-party service provider, it was noted that the TPB specified in the Terms of Reference (TOR) that the sample size for the 2020 customer satisfaction survey is projected to range from 224 to a maximum of 300 respondents. Under Item IV.C. of the <i>Enhanced Standard</i>
SM 6b	Percentage of Satisfied Customers (Attendees)		2.5%		90%	Familiarization Trip Participants & Social	2.5%				

Component						TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure			Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual			Rating
SM 6c		Percentage of Satisfied Customers (Familiarization Trip Participants and Social Media Influencers)		2.5%		90%	Media Influencers: 96.88% are Satisfied	2.5%			Customer Satisfaction Survey	<i>Methodology for the Conduct of the Customer Satisfaction Survey</i> , the prescribed sample size for the customer segment 'Attendees' is 300 while the total universe should be targeted as survey respondents for customer segments 'Exhibitors' and 'Familiarization Tour Participants'. It shall also be noted that the TPB's target sample size of 300 was for all customer types instead of the "per customer type" approach as indicated in the guidelines of the Governance Commission.
							Overall Satisfaction Rating: 96.83%				Quality Control Report	
Sub-total				60%				60%		0%		

Component						TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating				
FINANCIAL	SO 4	Maintain Efficient, Accountable and Transparent Financial Process and Systems										
	SM 7a	Utilization of Corporate Operating Funds	Total Obligations (net of PS and SCF) / Total COB as Approved by the DBM (net of PS and SCF)	5%	$\frac{(\text{Actual} / \text{Target}) \times \text{Weight}}$	Not Lower Than 90% But Not Exceeding 100% (excluding PS, SCF and PEC)	92% Utilization as of December 2020	5%	89.87%	4.99%	Budget Utilization Reports DBM-Approved Corporate Operating Budget Statement of Appropriations, Allotments, Obligations, Disbursements and Balances (SAAODB)	The validated actual is based on the submitted SAAODB and 2020 COA Audit Report. The DBM-approved uses of funds amounted to ₱1.161 Billion includes provision for Personnel Services (PS) Cost and Special Contingency Fund (SCF). As validated by the Governance Commission, the total budget excluding PS cost (₱102.16 Million) and SCF (₱87.03 Million) amounted to ₱972.201 Million, of which only ₱873.76 Million were obligated and ₱564.89 Million were disbursed, by end of December 2020.
	SM 7b	Utilization of Corporate Operating Funds	Total Disbursements (net of PS) / Total COB as Approved by the DBM (net of PS and SCF)	5%	$(\text{Actual} / \text{Target}) \times \text{Weight}$	85% Disbursement (excluding PS, SCF, and PEC)	86% Disbursement as of August 2021	5%	58.10%	3.42%	Special Allotment Release Order (SARO) 2020 COA Audit Report	The Governance Commission takes this opportunity to note that based on the SAAODB report submitted, funds obligated and disbursed were sourced from the subsidy released to the TPB despite the generation of funds in the amount of ₱3.258 Million. Further, the Governance Commission notes that the DBM-approved COB specifically excluded the amount of ₱19.836 Million for Personal Services cost which

Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component						TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure			Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual		
											includes provision for Educational Bonus (P4.532 Million), Socio-Economic Bonus (P6.017 Million) and Christmas Bonus (P5.881 Million) for lack of legal basis. However, in the submitted SAAODB report, the TPB noted that these traditional bonuses were granted and charged against its corporate funds: Educational Assistance (P5.052 Million), Socio-Economic (P5.166 Million), and Christmas Incentive (P5.440 Million). The Governance Commission also adjusted the rating scale for SM7a to be uniform with that of SM 7b.
	Sub-total			10%				10%		8.41%	
INTERNAL PROCESS	SO 5	Maintain Efficient, Accountable and Transparent Administrative Process and Systems									
	SM 8	Improve Percentage of Application Processed within Prescribed Turnaround Time ⁴	Total Number of Applications Processed Within Prescribed Turnaround Time ⁵ / Total Number of Applications Received	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	100%	557 out of 566 Transactions were Acted Upon Within the Prescribed Timeline	9.84%	Cannot Be Validated	0%	Monitoring Report of Transactions per Process TPB Citizen's Charter

⁴ The processes included in this measure are frontline services that cater to TPB's external clients such as Assistance to Booked Events, Bidding for International Events and Organizing/Hosting of Special and Institutional Events.

⁵ The period turnaround time shall be based on TPB's Citizen's charter and its compliance following Republic Act No. 11302, otherwise known as Ease of Doing Business and Efficient Government Service Delivery Act of 2018.

Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component						TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure			Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating	
											Request for Collateral Materials. Upon review of the TPB's Citizen's Charter, the Governance Commission found that only processes (d) and (e) as noted above are included in the Citizen's Charter. During the online validation, the TPB explained that the Citizen's Charter was recalibrated and streamlined through an Anti-Red Tape Authority (ARTA) Compliance Report submitted by the corporation to the ARTA through a letter dated 23 July 2020. Moreover, the TPB informed the Governance Commission that the ARTA Compliance Report was the basis for the turnaround time of the processes. However, review of the document showed that similar with the Citizen's Charter, only processes (d) and (e) were provided with information on the processing time. The Governance Commission reviewed the submitted Summary Reports for transactions that fall under either process (d) or process (e). However, the Governance

Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component						TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target		Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
											Commission cannot undertake the proper validation of the actual turnaround time for such transactions as the Summary Reports contained incomplete and unverifiable date formats. Please see Appendix 1 for sample.
SM 9	Attain ISO Certification	Actual Accomplishment	10%	All or Nothing	Maintain ISO 9001:2015 Certificate	Recommended for Continued Certification Based on the Result of External Audit last 02 December 2020	10%	ISO 9001:2015 Certificate Maintained	10%	Audit Report Confirmation Letter from the Certification International Philippines	Acceptable.
Sub-total		20%					19.84%		10%		
SO 6 Sustain a Culture of Organizational Engagement that Fosters Effective Performance, Lifelong Learning and Growth											
SM 10	Improve Competency of the Organization	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	<u>Board-Approved Competency Framework</u>	Board Resolution No. 282 - TPB Competency Framework TPB Board-Approved Competency-Based Framework	10%	Board-Approved Competency Framework	5%	Board-Approved Competency-Based Framework Board Resolution Summary Competency Gaps per Competency	Acceptable. However, the Governance Commission noted that the approval of the Competency-Based Framework is "subject to further vetting by the TPB's Personnel and Human Resources Development division (PHRDD) vis-à-vis the job descriptions through the conduct of validation and calibration sessions". Upon clarification with the TPB, such condition was placed by the Board of Directors to ensure that the PHRDD will generate a Competency Report of the corporation based on the

LEARNING & GROWTH

Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component					TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
										Competency-Based Job Descriptions (CBJDs).
	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Establish Competency Baseline ⁶ of All Employees	104 Individual Competency Profiles Submitted for 100% Submission		104 out of 106 Employees Assessed Cannot Be Validated	0%	Competency Assessment Reports for 2020 Excel File on the Computation of the Organization's Competency Baseline Details of Workforce Complement of the Organization Position Profiles of Positions	The 10% weight originally allocated for the measure was equally distributed to the two targets to give recognition to the accomplishment of competency framework. Two (2) new permanent employees were excluded in the competency assessment. The TPB clarified that a competency assessment for the new permanent employees was conducted in 2020. However, the Candidate Evaluation Form and the Position Description Form used in the assessment of the competency level of the employees are not based on the competencies under the Board-approved Competency Framework. The TPB represented that at the time of the assessment of the said employees, the current Competency Framework of the TPB was not yet approved.

⁶ The competency baseline of the organization shall pertain to the average percentage of required competencies met which can be computed using the following formula:

$$\frac{\sum_{b=1}^B \left[\frac{\sum_{a=1}^A \left(\frac{\text{Actual Competency Level}}{\text{Required Competency Level}} \right)_{ab}}{A} \right]_{ab}}{B} \text{ where: } a = \text{Competency required, } A = \text{Total number of competencies required of position, } b = \text{Personnel profiled, } B = \text{Total number of personnel profiled}$$

Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (*Annex A*)

Component						TPB Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure			Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating	
											Through a letter dated 06 May 2021, the Governance Commission reminded the TPB that the competency baseline should capture the holistic implementation of the competency framework covering, among others, hiring, training, and promotion of employees. As such, the competency assessment should cover 100% of its employees.
			<i>Sub-total</i>	<i>10%</i>				<i>10%</i>		<i>5%</i>	
			TOTAL	100%				99.84%		23.41%	

SM 8: IMPROVE PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS PROCESSED WITHIN PRESCRIBED TURNAROUND

Second Semester Transactions for Request for Images and Request for Collateral Materials
(as submitted by the TPB)

REQUEST FOR IMAGES

Name of Requesting Party	Date of Request	Date of Approval/ Disapproval	Prescribed Turnaround Time	Actual Turnaround Time
Shangri-La Boracay Spa&Resort	17 July 2020	19 July 2020	8 Days, 1 Hour	3 Days
PDOT UK	21 July 2020	23 July 2020	8 Days, 1 Hour	4 Days
Dubai Expo 2020/2021	29 July 2020	3 August 2020	8 Days, 1 Hour	3 Days
2020 PWA	11 August	13 August	8 Days, 1 Hour	2 Days
Rotary International Convention 2026	10 August 2020	13 August 2020	8 Days, 1 Hour	4 Days
Progressive Web Application	11 August 2020	12 August 2020	8 Days, 1 Hour	2 Days
PDOT Tokyo	18 August 2020	20 August 2020	8 Days, 1 Hour	3 Days
PHITEX 2020 Infographics video	26 August 2020	31 August 2020	8 Days, 1 Hour	6 Days
Travel Pilipinas	08 September 2020	08 September 2020	8 Days, 1 Hour	1 Day
PDOT Korea	11 September 2020	11 September 2020	8 Days, 1 Hour	1 Day
PDOT-FRANKFURT	Sept. 25	Oct. 15	8 Days, 1 Hour	15 Days
VIRTUOSO	Oct. 08	Oct. 13	8 Days, 1 Hour	4 Days
CAEXPO	Oct. 08	Oct. 15	8 Days, 1 Hour	6 Days
PDOT-OSAKA	Oct. 08	Oct. 15	8 Days, 1 Hour	6 Days
PDOT-FRANKFURT	Oct. 12	Oct. 13	8 Days, 1 Hour	1 Day

Name of Requesting Party	Date of Request	Date of Approval/ Disapproval	Prescribed Turnaround Time	Actual Turnaround Time
PDOT-AUSTRALIA	Oct. 15	Oct. 21	8 Days, 1 Hour	5 Days
Team Asia	Nov. 13	Nov. 13	8 Days, 1 Hour	1 Day
FORBES ASIA	Nov. 16	Nov. 18	8 Days, 1 Hour	3 Days
PWA	Nov. 24	Nov. 26	8 Days, 1 Hour	3 Days
CITEM	Nov. 18	Nov. 20	8 Days, 1 Hour	10 Days
UP Manila National Institute of Health	Dec. 2	Dec. 4	8 Days, 1 Hour	2 Days
GOCC-OGCC Ad Photo	Dec. 11	Dec. 11	8 Days, 1 Hour	1 Day
PDOT-UK	Dec. 16	Dec. 18	8 Days, 1 Hour	3 Days
NAITAS	Dec. 23	Dec. 23	8 Days, 1 Hour	1 Day
SWIRETRAVEL PHILIPPINES	Dec. 18	Dec. 23	8 Days, 1 Hour	4 Days

Note: During the online validation, GCG representatives already requested TPB to properly format the dates in the summary report to be submitted to ensure ease of validation.

REQUEST FOR COLLATERAL MATERIALS

Name of Requesting Party	Date of Request	Date of Approval/ Disapproval	Prescribed Turnaround Time	Actual Turnaround Time
University of the Philippines AIT Alumni Association (UPAAA)	01 September 2020	04 September 2020	7 Days, 2 Hours, 30 Minutes	7 Days & 5 Hours Working Days
Terry Romilla of PAL	09 November 2020	10 November 2020	7 Days, 2 Hours And 30 Minutes	4 Working Days
Mr. Robert John of Q.C.	16 December 2020	18 December 2020	7 Days, 2 Hours And 30 Minutes	4 Working Days

Note: Document to validate the number of hours and minutes reported was not provided by the TPB. Data submitted only provides the number of days.